

COST AND BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF CONTRACTING OUT PRIMARY MEDICAL CARE  
TO PRIVATE CLINICS UNDER SOCIAL SECURITY SCHEME



Mr. Sanga Intajak

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for the Degree of Master of Science  
Department of Economics  
Graduate School  
Chulalongkorn University  
1996  
ISBN 974-634-564-8

Thesis title : COST AND BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF CONTRACTING OUT  
PRIMARY MEDICAL CARE TO PRIVATE CLINICS UNDER  
SOCIAL SECURITY SCHEME.

Graduate : SANGA INTAJAK.

Department : Economics

Advisor : Asst. Prof. Dr. Kaemthong Indaratana

Co-advisor : Dr. Paitoon Kaipornsak

---

Accepted by the graduate school, Chulalongkorn University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Degree of Master of Science in Health Economics.

*Santi Thoongsuwan*

..... Dean of  
Graduate  
(Assoc. Prof. Dr. Santi Thoongsuwan) School

Thesis Committee:

*Sothitorn Mallikamas*

..... Chairman  
(Asst. Prof. Dr. Sothitorn Mallikamas)

*K. Indaratana*

..... Advisor  
(Asst. Prof. Dr. Kaemthong Indaratana)

*Paitoon Kaipornsak*

..... Co-advisor  
(Dr. Paitoon Kaipornsak)

*P. Kamolratana*

..... Member  
(Prof. Dr. Pirom Kamolratanakul)

*C. Tangtatsawasdi*

..... Member  
(Dr. Cheimchai Tangtatsawasdi)

พิมพ์ต้นฉบับบทคัดย่อวิทยานิพนธ์ภายในกรอบสี่เหลี่ยมนี้เพียงแผ่นเดียว

## C860596 : MAJOR HEALTH ECONOMICS  
KEY WORD: COST-BENEFIT ANALYSIS / CONTRACTING OUT / PRIMARY  
MEDICAL CARE /  
SOCIAL SECURITY SCHEME / THAILAND  
SANGA INTAJAK : COST AND BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF CONTRACTING OUT  
PRIMARY MEDICAL CARE TO PRIVATE CLINICS UNDER SOCIAL SECURITY SCHEME.  
THESIS ADVISOR : ASST. PROF. DR. KAEMTHONG INDRAMATANA, Ph.D,  
THESIS CO-ADVISOR : DR. PAITON KAIPOUNSAK, Ph.D,  
69 pp. ISBN 974-634-564-8

This is a study, studies about costs and benefits of a programme for implementing the contracting out of primary medical care to private clinics and the impacts of the contracting out in terms of provision, utilization and efficiency improvement. Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital and its networks were selected to be the representative of public hospitals and their networks in Thailand.

The contracting out health care services is a new health services delivery system in Thailand, as in most developing countries, and it is believed that it can improve health services efficiency, by using public financing and private provision.

The study showed that the programme can achieve (1) allocative efficiency by making a contribution to prevention of some severe illnesses and to early recover; (2) fiscal efficiency as net monetary benefit is 12,594,925.75 baht and the benefit-cost ratio is 1.66; (3) technical efficiency since contracted private clinics can provide the health services with treatment charges for out-patient per visit and drug prescription cost per visit cheaper than the hospital provision. Other important outcomes of the study are (4) awareness of the high incremental administrative cost; (5) equity of access of insured workers to health services which are more readily available and (6) the service utilization rate increase of 50%

Regarding administrative efficiency, although the administrators are given authority and freedom to manage the social security budget by themselves, they have very low rewards so that the brain drain from public to private sector may trend to be encouraged. As for improvement of services provision, it can not be concluded from this study whether this has happened or not, because within one year of the health care provision, it might not have any effect on the overall society, it needs a more longitudinal study which uses appropriate indicators.

The contracting out primary medical care to private clinics is possible to implement for other main-contractors. But it needs more studies in detail, because the success of contracting out depends on many criteria, i.e. the number of main contractors, sub-contractors, competition among them and details of fiscal policy of each hospital, capacity of main-contractor to control sub-contractors.

ภาควิชา..... Economics.....  
สาขาวิชา..... Health Economics.....  
ปีการศึกษา..... 2538.....

ลายมือชื่อนิสิต.....  
ลายมือชื่ออาจารย์ที่ปรึกษา.....  
ลายมือชื่ออาจารย์ที่ปรึกษาร่วม.....

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply indebted to Asst. Prof. Dr. Kaemthong Indaratana, my thesis advisor and Dr. Paitoon Kaipornsak my thesis co-advisor, for their invaluable time, keen interest, support, guidance at every step of my thesis building and completion. Without their unaccountable guidance and support it would be impossible to complete this thesis in time. So, I am extremely grateful to my advisors.

Many sincere thanks are due to Prof. Dr. Pirom Kamolratanakul, Dr. Cheirnchai Tangtatsawasdi, Asst. Prof. Dr. Sothitorn Mallikamas and Dr. Chev Kidson who spared their most valuable time to provide me with the much needed knowledge and invaluable suggestions. I am also obliged to all Ajarns from the Centre for Health Economics for encouraging me throughout my study.

I can not over emphasize my sincere thanks to Dr. Chatri Banchuin, the director of Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital, Miss Pongsri Songtong, Mr. Udomsak Angsupisit, the director of Social Security Office, Ram Indra Branch, and their staff who offered me all assistance I needed in planning and collection of data for my study. I also express my sincere thanks to Miss. Chotima Sukapurana, Miss. Pachanee Rodsumpaow for their help in carrying out the formalities for implementing the whole study. My sincere thanks also goes to my Thai and international friends for their very nice encouragement.

I would like to express my thanks to the owners of private clinics and enterprises who gave the responses to my questionnaires.

I am very much grateful to the director of Chiang Rai Regional Hospital, Dr. Renu Srismith and the hospital committee for the financial support of this thesis.

Sanga Intajak

May, 1996

## CONTENTS

	Page
Abstract .....	i
Acknowledgements .....	ii
Contents .....	iii
List of Tables.....	v
List of Figures.....	vii
 Chapters	
1. Introduction .....	1
1.1 Background and rationale .....	1
1.2 Research Questions .....	3
1.3 Research Objectives .....	3
1.4 Scope of the Study .....	4
1.5 Possible Benefits .....	4
1.6 Definitions .....	5
2. Review of Literature .....	7
2.1 Health Care Delivery System .....	7
2.2 Privatization in Health Sector.....	7
2.3 Combinations of Public and Private Sector Financing and Provision.....	8
2.4 Approaches to Privatization .....	9
2.5 Public Management of Privatization .....	13
3. Research Methodology .....	14
3.1 Research Method .....	14
3.2 Conceptual Framework .....	14
3.3 Population and Sample .....	16
3.4 Data Collection .....	16
3.5 Data Analysis .....	22
4. Results and Sensitivity Analysis .....	24
4.1 Incremental Costs .....	28
4.2 Incremental Benefits .....	29
4.3 Administrative Efficiency Analysis .....	37
4.4 Financial Efficiency Analysis .....	38
4.5 Technical Efficiency Analysis .....	43
4.6 Impacts on Services Provision .....	43
4.7 Impacts on services Utilization .....	45

## CONTENTS (Continued)

	<b>Page</b>
5. Conclusion and Recommendations .....	46
5.1 Conclusion .....	46
5.2 Limitation .....	53
5.3 Recommendations .....	53
 References .....	 55
 Appendix .....	 58
1. Costs and Benefits Calculation .....	59
1.1 Incremental cost .....	59
1.2 Incremental Monetary Benefits .....	62
2. Questionnaire .....	64
2.1 Questionnaire for Contracted Private Clinic .....	64
2.2 Questionnaire for registered Enterprises .....	66
 Curriculum Vitae .....	 69

## LIST OF TABLES

### Table

4.1	Number of Insured workers in Thailand and in Bangkok (1992-1995).....	24
4.2	Estimated Number of Insured Workers Registered with Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital by Various Trend.....	25
4.3	Percent Market Share of Insured Workers (1991-1994).....	25
4.4	Cost Components and Incremental Cost for Implementing Contracting Out Primary Medical Care to Private Clinics in 1994.....	28
4.5	Monetary Benefit Components and Incremental Monetary Benefit for Implementing Contracting Out Primary Medical Care to Private Clinics.....	29
4.6	Out-patient Utilization Rate.....	30
4.7	The Available Networks of Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital.....	31
4.8	The Route for Insured Workers to get Treatment at the Most Convenient Health Facilities of Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital Network.....	31
4.9	Traveling Time for Going to get Treatment at the Most Convenient Health Facility within the Network.....	32
4.10	Services Provision Improvement Indicators.....	32
4.11	Number of Insured Workers Registered to Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital.....	33
4.12	Result from the Questionnaire for the Owner of Enterprises.....	34
4.13	Registered Reasons of the Employers to Choose Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital as the Main-contractor.....	34
4.14	The procedures for Employers to Select the Main-contractor.....	35
4.15	The Satisfaction of Insured Patients about Quality of Private Networks' Services.....	35
4.16	The Satisfaction of Insured Patients about Quality of Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital Services Compared with Before Implementation the Network.....	36

**LIST OF TABLES (Continued)****Table**

4.17	The Satisfaction of Insured Patients about Quality of Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital Services by Employers of Enterprises Registered After Implementing the Network.....	36
4.18	Estimated Expandable Expenditure for Each Type of Treatment.....	41
4.19	Indicators for Technical Efficiency Analysis.....	43
4.20	The Attitude of Private Clinic Within the Network.....	44



## LIST OF FIGURES

### Figure

3.1	Conceptual Framework.....	15
4.1	Estimated Number of insured Workers registered to Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital Compared with Percent Public Market Share of Insured Workers.....	26
4.2	Number of Insured Workers Registered to Nopparat Rajathanee Hospital.....	27